

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of)	
)	Agreement Containing Consent Order
)	
BENJAMIN MOORE & CO., INC.,)	File No. 1623079
a corporation.)	
)	
)	
)	

The Federal Trade Commission (“Commission”) has conducted an investigation of certain acts and practices of Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc. (“Proposed Respondent”). The Commission’s Bureau of Consumer Protection (“BCP”) has prepared a draft of an administrative Complaint (“draft Complaint”). BCP and Proposed Respondent, through their duly authorized officers, enter into this Agreement Containing Consent Order (“Consent Agreement”) to resolve the allegations in the attached draft Complaint through a proposed Decision and Order to present to the Commission, which is also attached and made a part of this Consent Agreement.

IT IS HEREBY AGREED by and between Proposed Respondent and BCP, that:

1. The Proposed Respondent is Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc., a New Jersey corporation with its principal office or place of business at 101 Paragon Drive, Montvale, New Jersey 07645.
2. Proposed Respondent neither admits nor denies any of the allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in the Decision and Order. Only for purposes of this action, Proposed Respondent admits the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction.
3. Proposed Respondent waives:
 - a. Any further procedural steps;
 - b. The requirement that the Commission’s Decision contain a statement of findings of fact and conclusions of law; and
 - c. All rights to seek judicial review or otherwise to challenge or contest the validity of the Decision and Order issued pursuant to this Consent Agreement.
4. This Consent Agreement will not become part of the public record of the proceeding unless and until it is accepted by the Commission. If the Commission accepts this Consent Agreement, it, together with the draft Complaint, will be placed on the public record for 30 days and information about it publicly released. Acceptance does not constitute final approval, but it serves as the basis for further actions leading to final disposition of the matter. Thereafter, the

Commission may either withdraw its acceptance of this Consent Agreement and so notify Proposed Respondent, in which event the Commission will take such action as it may consider appropriate, or issue and serve its Complaint (in such form as the circumstances may require) and decision in disposition of the proceeding, which may include an Order. See Section 2.34 of the Commission's Rules, 16 C.F.R. § 2.34.

5. If this agreement is accepted by the Commission, and if such acceptance is not subsequently withdrawn by the Commission pursuant to Commission Rule 2.34, the Commission may, without further notice to Proposed Respondent: (1) issue its Complaint corresponding in form and substance with the attached draft Complaint and its Decision and Order; and (2) make information about them public. Proposed Respondent agrees that service of the Order may be effected by its publication on the Commission's website (ftc.gov), at which time the Order will become final. See Rule 2.32(d). Proposed Respondent waives any rights it may have to any other manner of service. See Rule 4.4.

6. When final, the Decision and Order will have the same force and effect and may be altered, modified, or set aside in the same manner and within the same time provided by statute for other Commission orders.

7. The Complaint may be used in construing the terms of the Decision and Order. No agreement, understanding, representation, or interpretation not contained in the Decision and Order or in this Consent Agreement may be used to vary or contradict the terms of the Decision and Order.

8. Proposed Respondent agrees to comply with the terms of the proposed Decision and Order from the date it signs this Consent Agreement. Proposed Respondent understands that it may be liable for civil penalties and other relief for each violation of the Decision and Order after it becomes final.

Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc.

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

By: _____
Name: _____
Title: _____
Date: _____

By: _____
Katherine Johnson
Attorney, Bureau of Consumer Protection
Date: _____

COUNSEL TO PROPOSED RESPONDENT:

APPROVED:

By: _____
Mark D. Godler
Kaye Scholer LLP
250 West 55th Street
New York, New York 10019-9710

By: _____
James A. Kohm
Associate Director, Enforcement Division
Date: _____

T: (212) 836-7087
F: (212) 836-6487
Mark.Godler@kayescholer.com
Date: _____

By: _____
Thomas B. Pahl, Acting Director
Bureau of Consumer Protection
Date: _____

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**

COMMISSIONERS: **Maureen K. Ohlhausen, Acting Chairman**
 Terrell McSweeney

<p>In the Matter of</p> <p>BENJAMIN MOORE & CO., INC., a corporation.</p>	<p>)</p> <p>)</p> <p>)</p> <p>)</p> <p>)</p> <p>)</p> <p>)</p>	<p>Decision and Order</p> <p>Docket No. C-_____</p>
---	--	--

DECISION

The Federal Trade Commission (“Commission”) initiated an investigation of certain acts and practices of the Respondent named above in the caption. The Commission’s Bureau of Consumer Protection (“BCP”) prepared and furnished to Respondent a draft Complaint. BCP proposed to present the draft Complaint to the Commission for its consideration. If issued by the Commission, the draft Complaint would charge the Respondent with violations of the Federal Trade Commission Act.

Respondent and BCP thereafter executed an Agreement Containing Consent Order (“Consent Agreement”). The Consent Agreement includes: 1) statements by Respondent that it neither admits nor denies any of the allegations in the Complaint, except as specifically stated in this Decision and Order, and that only for purposes of this action, Respondent admits the facts necessary to establish jurisdiction; and 2) waivers and other provisions as required by the Commission’s Rules.

The Commission considered the matter and determined that it had reason to believe that Respondent has violated the Federal Trade Commission Act, and that a Complaint should issue stating its charges in that respect. The Commission accepted the executed Consent Agreement and placed it on the public record for a period of 30 days for the receipt and consideration of public comments. The Commission duly considered any comments received from interested persons pursuant to Section 2.34 of its Rules, 16 C.F.R. § 2.34. Now, in further conformity with the procedure prescribed in Rule 2.34, the Commission issues its Complaint, makes the following Findings, and issues the following Order:

Findings

1. The Respondent is Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc, a New Jersey corporation with its principal office or place of business at 101 Paragon Drive, Montvale, New Jersey 07645.
2. The Commission has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this proceeding and over the Respondent, and the proceeding is in the public interest.

ORDER

Definitions

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions apply:

- A. “Clearly and conspicuously” means that a required disclosure is difficult to miss (i.e., easily noticeable) and easily understandable by ordinary consumers, including in all of the following ways:
 1. In any communication that is solely visual or solely audible, the disclosure must be made through the same means through which the communication is presented. In any communication made through both visual and audible means, such as a television advertisement, the disclosure must be presented simultaneously in both the visual and audible portions of the communication even if the representation requiring the disclosure is made through only one means.
 2. A visual disclosure, by its size, contrast, location, the length of time it appears, and other characteristics, must stand out from any accompanying text or other visual elements so that it is easily noticed, read, and understood.
 3. An audible disclosure, including by telephone or streaming video, must be delivered in a volume, speed, and cadence sufficient for ordinary consumers to easily hear and understand it.
 4. In any communication using an interactive electronic medium, such as the Internet or software, the disclosure must be unavoidable.
 5. On a product label, the disclosure must be presented on the principal display panel.
 6. The disclosure must use diction and syntax understandable to ordinary consumers and must appear in each language in which the representation that requires the disclosure appears.
 7. The disclosure must comply with these requirements in each medium through which it is received, including all electronic devices and face-to-face communications.

8. The disclosure must not be contradicted or mitigated by, or inconsistent with, anything else in the communication.
 9. When the representation or sales practice targets a specific audience, such as children, the elderly, or the terminally ill, “ordinary consumers” includes reasonable members of that group.
- B. “Close proximity” means that the disclosure is very near the triggering representation. In an interactive electronic medium (such as a mobile app or other computer program), a visual disclosure that cannot be viewed at the same time and in the same viewable area as the triggering representation, on the technology used by ordinary consumers, is not in close proximity. A disclosure made through a hyperlink, pop-up, interstitial, or other similar technique is not in close proximity to the triggering representation. A disclosure made on a different printed page than the triggering representation is not in close proximity.
 - C. “Covered product” means any architectural coating applied to stationary structures, portable structures, and their appurtenances.
 - D. “Volatile Organic Compound” (“VOC”) means any compound of carbon that participates in atmospheric photochemical reactions, but excludes carbon monoxide, carbon dioxide, carbonic acid, metallic carbides or carbonates, ammonium carbonate, and specific compounds that the EPA has determined are of negligible photochemical reactivity, which are listed at 40 C.F.R. Section 51.100(s).
 - E. “Emission” means any compound that is emitted or produced during application, curing, or exposure of a covered product.
 - F. “Trace” level of emission means:
 1. A VOC has not been intentionally added to the covered product;
 2. Emission of the covered product does not cause material harm that consumers typically associate with emission, including harm to the environment or human health; and
 3. Emission of the covered product does not result in more than harmless concentrations of any compound higher than would be found under normal conditions in the typical residential home without interior architectural coating.
 - G. “Certification” means any seal, logo, emblem, shield, or other insignia that expresses or implies approval or endorsement of any product, package, service, practice, or program, or any attribute thereof.
 - H. “Respondent” means Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc. and its successor and assigns.

I. Prohibited Misleading and Unsubstantiated Representations Regarding Emission and VOC Level of Covered Product

IT IS ORDERED that Respondent, and Respondent’s officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any covered product must not make any representation, expressly or by implication, that the emission level of a covered product is zero, or that the VOC level of a covered product is zero, unless the representation is non-misleading, including that, at the time such representation is made, Respondent possesses and relies upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that is sufficient in quality and quantity based on standards generally accepted in the relevant scientific fields, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable scientific evidence, to substantiate that:

- A. The covered product’s emission is zero micrograms per meter cubed and the covered product’s VOC content is zero grams per liter; or
- B. The covered product does not emit or produce more than a trace level of emission.

For purposes of this Provision, “competent and reliable scientific evidence” means tests, analyses, research, or studies that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons and are generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.

II. Prohibited Misleading and Unsubstantiated Representations Regarding Environmental and Health Claims

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent, and Respondent’s officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any covered product must not make any representation, expressly or by implication, including through the use of a product name, regarding:

- A. The emission of the covered product;
- B. The VOC level of the covered product;
- C. The odor of the covered product;
- D. Any other health benefit or attribute of, or risk associated with exposure to, the covered product, including those related to VOC, emission, or chemical composition; or
- E. Any other environmental benefit or attribute of the covered product, including those related to VOC, emission, or chemical composition,

unless the representation is non-misleading, including that, at the time such representation is made, Respondent possesses and relies upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that is sufficient in quality and quantity based on standards generally accepted in the relevant scientific fields, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable scientific evidence, to substantiate that the representation is true. For purposes of this Provision, “competent and reliable scientific evidence” means tests, analyses, research, or studies that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by qualified persons and are generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.

III. Notice to Dealers and Distributors

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent deliver as soon as practicable, but in no event later than 60 days after the effective date of this Order, a notice in the form shown in Attachment A to all of Respondent’s dealers and distributors, and all other entities to which Respondent provided point-of-sale advertising, including product labels, for any covered product identified in Attachment A. The notice required by this paragraph must not include any document or other enclosures other than those referenced in Attachment A.

IV. Prohibited Misleading Certification Marks

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent and Respondent’s officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any covered product must not make any misrepresentation, expressly or by implication, regarding certifications, including:

- A. The fact that, or degree to which, a third party has, evaluated a product, package, service, practice, or program based on its environmental benefits or attributes; or
- B. That a certification is endorsed by an independent person or organization.

V. Disclosure of Material Connection

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent and Respondent’s officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any product, package, certification, service, practice, or program, must not make any representation, in any manner, expressly or by implication, about any user or endorser of such product, package, certification, service, practice, or program unless Respondent discloses, clearly and conspicuously, and in close proximity to the representation, any unexpected material connection, when one exists, between such user or endorser and (1) the Respondent or (2) any other individual or entity affiliated with the product or service. For purposes of this Provision, “unexpected material connection” means any relationship that might materially affect the weight

or credibility of the testimonial or endorsement and that would not reasonably be expected by consumers.

VI. Means and Instrumentalities

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent, and its officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, or sale of any covered product, must not provide to others the means and instrumentalities with which to make, directly or indirectly, expressly or by implication, including through the use of endorsements or trade names, any false, unsubstantiated, or otherwise misleading representation of material fact, including but not limited to any representation prohibited by Provisions I, II, IV, or V, above. For purposes of this Provision, “means and instrumentalities” shall mean any information, including, but not necessarily limited to, any advertising, labeling, or promotional, sales training, or purported substantiation materials, for use by trade customers in their marketing of any covered product, in or affecting commerce.

VII. Acknowledgments of the Order

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

- A. Respondent, within 10 days after the effective date of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.
- B. Respondent must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Provision titled Compliance Report and Notices. Delivery must occur within 10 days after the effective date of this Order for current personnel. For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.
- C. From each individual or entity to which Respondent delivered a copy of this Order, Respondent must obtain, within 30 days after delivery, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

VIII. Compliance Report and Notices

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent make timely submissions to the Commission:

- A. Sixty days after the issuance date of this Order, Respondent must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury, in which Respondent must: (1) identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and telephone number, as designated points

of contact, which representatives of the Commission may use to communicate with Respondent; (2) identify all of Respondent's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (3) describe the activities of each business; (4) describe in detail whether and how Respondent is in compliance with each Provision of this Order, including a discussion of all of the changes the Respondent made to comply with the Order and a copy of the notice sent to dealers and distributors; and (5) provide a copy of each Acknowledgment of the Order obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously submitted to the Commission.

- B. Respondent must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within 14 days of any change in any designated point of contact or the structure of Respondent or any entity that Respondent has any ownership interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including the creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order.
- C. Respondent must submit notice of the filing of any bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or similar proceeding by or against Respondent within 14 days of its filing.
- D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: "I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on: _____" and supplying the date, signatory's full name, title (if applicable), and signature.
- E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing, all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: In re Benjamin Moore, Docket No. _____.

IX. Recordkeeping

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent must create certain records and retain each such record for 5 years. Specifically, Respondent must create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all goods or services sold;
- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person's: name; addresses; telephone numbers; job title or position; dates of service; and (if applicable) the reason for termination;

- C. Records of all consumer complaints concerning the subject matter of the Order , including complaints involving representations covered by Parts I, II, IV, or V of the Order, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;
- D. A copy of each unique advertisement or other marketing material making a representation subject to this Order;
- E. For 5 years from the date of the last dissemination of any representation covered by this Order:
 - 1. All materials that were relied upon in making the representation; and
 - 2. All tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence in Respondent's possession, custody, or control that contradicts, qualifies, or otherwise calls into question the representation, or the basis relied upon for the representation, including complaints and other communications with consumers or with governmental or consumer protection organizations; and
- F. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission.

X. Compliance Monitoring

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring Respondent's compliance with this Order:

- A. Within 10 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, Respondent must submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury, and produce records for inspection and copying.
- B. For matters concerning this Order, representatives of the Commission are authorized to communicate directly with Respondent. Respondent must permit representatives of the Commission to interview anyone affiliated with Respondent who has agreed to such an interview. The interviewee may have counsel present.
- C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing through its representatives as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Respondent or any individual or entity affiliated with Respondent, without the necessity of identification or prior notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

XI. Order Effective Dates

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Order is final and effective upon the date of its publication on the Commission's website (ftc.gov) as a final order. This Order will terminate 20 years from the date of its issuance (which is stated at the end of this Order, next to the Commission's seal), or 20 years from the most recent date that the United States or the Commission files a complaint (with or without an accompanying settlement) in federal court alleging any violation of this Order, whichever comes later; *provided, however*, that the filing of such a complaint will not affect the duration of:

- A. Any provision in this Order that terminates in less than 20 years;
- B. This Order's application to any Respondent that is not named as a defendant in such complaint; and
- C. This Order if such complaint is filed after the Order has terminated pursuant to this provision.

If such complaint is dismissed or a federal court rules that the Respondent did not violate any provision of the Order, and the dismissal or ruling is either not appealed or upheld on appeal, then the Order will terminate according to this provision as though the complaint had never been filed, except that the Order will not terminate between the date such complaint is filed and the later of the deadline for appealing such dismissal or ruling and the date such dismissal or ruling is upheld on appeal.

By the Commission.

Donald S. Clark
Secretary

SEAL:
ISSUED:

Attachment A: Notice to Dealers and Distributors

[on Respondent letterhead]

[insert date]

IMPORTANT NOTICE ABOUT _____
ADVERTISING AND MARKETING MATERIALS

[insert addressee name]

[insert addressee address used in the ordinary course of business]

Dear Dealer or Distributor,

In response to a complaint from the Federal Trade Commission, Benjamin Moore & Co., Inc. has agreed not to make claims that its paints contain zero VOCs (volatile organic compounds) or other harmful emissions, unless we can substantiate that the level is actually zero or otherwise comply with the settlement terms. We request that you immediately stop using existing _____ advertising and marketing materials that represent the emission level of any paint is zero, or that the VOC level of any paint is zero.

In addition, our in-house Green Promise certification mark did not adequately identify it as a self-certification or the specific characteristics of the certification.

We have included placards that you must display clearly and prominently next to the paint containers and at each point of sale to eliminate any misrepresentation to consumers. Enclosed are illustrations of how to properly place the placards. The placards must be displayed until you have sold all paint containers bearing the problematic claims.

We will make revised marketing materials available to you shortly. Should you have any questions about compliance with this notice, please contact [insert contact person]. In addition, you can obtain further information about the settlement by visiting www.ftc.gov and searching for “Benjamin Moore.”

Sincerely,
[name]

LABEL UPDATE:
Benjamin Moore’s “Zero Emission”
and “Zero VOC” Paints

All “Zero Emission” and “Zero VOC” (volatile organic compound) paints emit chemicals during the painting process and while drying. Some of these chemicals can be harmful to people, especially to sensitive groups such as babies and those suffering from asthma or allergies.

- Benjamin Moore Natura® Waterborne Interior “Zero Emission” paints may emit chemicals for the first 4 hours after latest application.
- Benjamin Moore “Zero VOC” interior paints may emit chemicals for the first 14 days after application.

LABEL UPDATE:
Benjamin Moore’s “Green Promise” Certification

Benjamin Moore’s Green Promise® designation is the Company’s assurance that this product meets—and often exceeds—rigorous environmental and performance criteria regarding VOCs, emissions, application, washability, scrubbability, and packaging, while also delivering the premium levels of performance you expect from Benjamin Moore.