

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE
DISTRICT OF WYOMING**

FILED
U.S. DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF WYOMING
2016 SEP 12 PM 3:48
STEPHAN HARRIS, CLERK
CASPER

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
v.)
)
COORGA NUTRACEUTICALS CORP.,)
a corporation, and,)
)
GARFIELD COORE, individually and as an)
officer of COORGA NUTRACEUTICALS CORP.,)
)
Defendants.)
_____)

No: 15CV072-SWS

FINAL JUDGMENT AND
ORDER FOR PERMANENT
INJUNCTION AND OTHER
EQUITABLE RELIEF

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission (“Commission” or “FTC”), filed its Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief (“Complaint”), for a permanent injunction and other equitable relief in this matter, pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (“FTC Act”), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b). Defendants COORGA Nutraceuticals Corporation and Garfield Coore having been found to have violated Sections 5 and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45, 52, the Court hereby issues the Final Judgment and Order for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief (“Order”).

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED as follows:

FINDINGS

1. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter.
2. Defendants COORGA Nutraceuticals Corporation and Garfield Coore have participated in deceptive acts or practices and false advertisements in violation of Sections 5 and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 52, in connection with the labeling, advertising,

marketing, distribution, and sale of the Grey Defence dietary supplement.

ORDER

DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions apply:

1. “Advertisement” or “advertising” or “ad” means any written or verbal statement, illustration, or depiction that promotes the sale of a good or service or is designed to increase consumer interest in a brand, good, or service. Advertising media include, but are not limited to, packaging and labeling; promotional materials; print; television; radio; and internet, social media, and other digital content.
2. “Commerce” means as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
3. “Corporate Defendant” means COORGA Nutraceuticals Corporation and its successors and assigns.
4. “Covered Product” means any dietary supplement, food, drug, or cosmetic, including, but not limited to, the Grey Defence, Grey Defence Xtreme, Grey Defence Xtreme 2.0, and Grey Defence Gene*JOLT!* dietary supplements.
5. “Defendants” means the Individual Defendant and the Corporate Defendant.
6. “Endorsement” means as defined in 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(b).
7. “Essentially Equivalent Product” means a product that contains the identical ingredients, except for inactive ingredients (*e.g.*, binders, colors, fillers, excipients), in the same form and dosage, and with the same route of administration (*e.g.*, in the case of a dietary supplement, orally, sublingually), as the Covered Product; *provided that* the Covered Product may contain additional ingredients if reliable scientific evidence generally accepted by experts in the relevant field indicates that the amount and combination of additional ingredients is unlikely

to impede or inhibit the effectiveness of the ingredients in the Essentially Equivalent Product.

8. “Food,” “drug,” and “cosmetic” mean as defined in Section 15 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 55.

9. “Individual Defendant” means Garfield Coore.

10. “Person” means a natural person, an organization, or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.

11. “Reliably Reported,” for a human clinical test or study (“test”), means a report of the test has been published in a peer-reviewed journal, and such published report provides sufficient information about the test for experts in the relevant field to assess the reliability of the results.

12. The term “including” in this Order means “including without limitation.”

13. The terms “and” and “or” in this Order shall be construed conjunctively or disjunctively as necessary, to make the applicable phrase or sentence inclusive rather than exclusive.

I.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS:

GRAY HAIR AND DISEASE CLAIMS

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants’ officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product, are permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or assisting others in

making, any representation, expressly or by implication, including through the use of a product or program name, Endorsement, depiction, or illustration, that such Covered Product:

- A. Reverses, prevents, or helps protect against the formation of gray hair; or
- B. Cures, mitigates, or treats any disease,

unless the representation is non-misleading and, at the time of making such representation, Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence substantiating that the representation is true.

For purposes of this Section, competent and reliable scientific evidence shall consist of human clinical testing of the Covered Product or of an Essentially Equivalent Product that is sufficient in quality and quantity, based on standards generally accepted by experts in the relevant disease, condition, or function to which the representation relates, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable scientific evidence, to substantiate that the representation is true. Such testing shall be: (1) randomized, double-blind, and placebo-controlled; and (2) conducted by researchers qualified by training and experience to conduct such testing. In addition, all underlying or supporting data and documents generally accepted by experts in the field as relevant to an assessment of such testing as described in the Section entitled Preservation of Records Relating to Competent and Reliable Human Clinical Tests or Studies must be available for inspection and production to the Commission. Defendants shall have the burden of proving that a product satisfies the definition of an Essentially Equivalent Product.

II.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS: HEALTH-RELATED CLAIMS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees,

and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product, are permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or assisting others in making, expressly or by implication, including through the use of a product or program name, Endorsement, depiction, or illustration, any representation, other than representations covered under Section I of this Order, about the health benefits, performance, or efficacy of any Covered Product, unless the representation is non-misleading, and, at the time of making such representation, Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that is sufficient in quality and quantity based on standards generally accepted by experts in the relevant disease, condition, or function to which the representation relates, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable scientific evidence, to substantiate that the representation is true.

For purposes of this Section, competent and reliable scientific evidence means tests, analyses, research, or studies (1) that have been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by experts in the relevant disease, condition, or function to which the representation relates; (2) that are generally accepted by such experts to yield accurate and reliable results; and (3) that are randomized, double-blind, and placebo-controlled human clinical testing of the Covered Product, or of an Essentially Equivalent Product, when such experts would generally require such human clinical testing to substantiate that the representation is true. In addition, when such tests or studies are human clinical tests or studies, all underlying or supporting data and documents generally accepted by experts in the field as relevant to an assessment of such testing as set forth in the Section entitled Preservation of Records Relating to Competent and Reliable Human

Clinical Tests or Studies must be available for inspection and production to the Commission.

Defendants shall have the burden of proving that a product satisfies the definition of Essentially Equivalent Product.

III.

PRESERVATION OF RECORDS RELATING TO COMPETENT AND RELIABLE HUMAN CLINICAL TESTS OR STUDIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, with regard to any human clinical test or study (“test”) upon which Defendants rely to substantiate any claim covered by this Order, Defendants shall secure and preserve all underlying or supporting data and documents generally accepted by experts in the field as relevant to an assessment of the test, including, but not necessarily limited to:

A. All protocols and protocol amendments, reports, articles, write-ups, or other accounts of the results of the test, and drafts of such documents reviewed by the test sponsor or any other person not employed by the research entity;

B. All documents referring or relating to recruitment; randomization; instructions, including oral instructions, to participants; and participant compliance;

C. Documents sufficient to identify all test participants, including any participants who did not complete the test, and all communications with any participants relating to the test; all raw data collected from participants enrolled in the test, including any participants who did not complete the test; source documents for such data; any data dictionaries; and any case report forms;

D. All documents referring or relating to any statistical analysis of any test data, including, but not limited to, any pretest analysis, intent-to-treat analysis, or between-group analysis performed on any test data; and

E. All documents referring or relating to the sponsorship of the test, including all communications and contracts, between any sponsor and the test's researchers.

Provided, however, the preceding preservation requirement shall not apply to a Reliably Reported test, unless the test was conducted, controlled, or sponsored, in whole or in part by: (1) any Defendant; (2) any Defendant's officers, agents, representatives, or employees; (3) any other person or entity in active concert or participation with any Defendant; (4) any person or entity affiliated with or acting on behalf of any Defendant; (5) any supplier of any ingredient contained in the product at issue to any of the foregoing or to the product's manufacturer; or (6) the supplier or manufacturer of such product.

For any test conducted, controlled, or sponsored, in whole or in part, by Defendants, Defendants must establish and maintain reasonable procedures to protect the confidentiality, security, and integrity of any personal information collected from or about participants. These procedures shall be documented in writing and shall contain administrative, technical, and physical safeguards appropriate to Defendants' size and complexity, the nature and scope of Defendants' activities, and the sensitivity of the personal information collected from or about the participants.

IV.

PROHIBITED REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING TESTS OR STUDIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who

receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any Covered Product are permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, in any manner, expressly or by implication, including through the use of any product or program name, Endorsement, depiction, or illustration:

A. The existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test, study, or research; or

B. That the benefits of such product are scientifically proven.

V.

FDA APPROVED CLAIMS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that nothing in this Order shall prohibit Defendants from:

A. Making any representation for any drug that is permitted in labeling for such drug under any tentative or final monograph promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration, or under any new drug application approved by the Food and Drug Administration; and

B. Making any representation for any product that is specifically permitted in labeling for such product by regulations promulgated by the Food and Drug Administration pursuant to the Nutrition Labeling and Education Act of 1990 or permitted under Sections 303-304 of the Food and Drug Administration Modernization Act of 1997.

VI.

MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. Judgment in the amount of \$391,335 is entered in favor of the Commission against Defendants, jointly and severally, as equitable monetary relief.

B. Defendants acknowledge that their Taxpayer Identification Numbers (Social Security Numbers or Employer Identification Numbers), which Defendants must submit to the Commission, may be used for collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. §7701.

C. All money paid to the Commission pursuant to this Order may be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its designee to be used for equitable relief, including consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress fund. If a representative of the Commission decides that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or money remains after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining money for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any money not used for such equitable relief is to be deposited to the U.S. Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants have no right to challenge any actions the Commission or its representatives may take pursuant to this Subsection.

VII.

CUSTOMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, are permanently restrained and enjoined from directly or indirectly:

A. Failing to provide sufficient customer information to enable the Commission to efficiently administer consumer redress. If a representative of the Commission requests in writing any information related to redress, Defendants must provide it, in the form prescribed by

the Commission, within 14 days.

B. Disclosing, using, or benefitting from customer information, including the name, address, telephone number, email address, social security number, other identifying information, or any data that enables access to a customer's account (including a credit card, bank account, or other financial account), that any Defendant obtained prior to entry of this Order in connection with the sale of any Grey Defence dietary supplements; and

C. Failing to destroy such customer information in all forms in their possession, custody, or control within 30 days after receipt of written direction to do so from a representative of the Commission.

Provided, however, that customer information need not be disposed of, and may be disclosed, to the extent requested by a government agency or required by law, regulation, or court order.

VIII.

ORDER ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants obtain acknowledgments of receipt of this Order:

A. Each Defendant, within 7 days of entry of this Order, must submit to the Commission an acknowledgment of receipt of this Order sworn under penalty of perjury.

B. For 10 years after entry of this Order, the Individual Defendant for any business that such Defendant, individually or collectively with the Corporate Defendant, is the majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, and the Corporate Defendant, must deliver a copy of this Order to: (1) all principals, officers, directors, and LLC managers and members; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives who participate in conduct related to the subject matter of

the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure as set forth in the Section titled Compliance Reporting. Delivery must occur within 7 days of entry of this Order for current personnel. For all others, delivery must occur before they assume their responsibilities.

C. From each individual or entity to which a Defendant delivered a copy of this Order, that Defendant must obtain, within 30 days, a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of this Order.

IX.

COMPLIANCE REPORTING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants make timely submissions to the Commission:

A. Sixty days after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance report, sworn under penalty of perjury:

1. Each Defendant must: (a) identify the primary physical, postal, and email address and telephone number, as designated points of contact, which representatives of the Commission may use to communicate with that Defendant; (b) identify all of that Defendant's businesses by all of their names, telephone numbers, and physical, postal, email, and Internet addresses; (c) describe the activities of each business, including the products and services offered, the means of advertising, marketing, and sales, and the involvement of the other Defendant (which Individual Defendant must describe if he knows or should know due to his own involvement); (d) describe in detail whether and how that Defendant is in compliance with each Section of this Order; and (e) provide a copy of each Order Acknowledgment obtained pursuant to this Order, unless previously

submitted to the Commission.

2. Additionally, the Individual Defendant must: (a) identify all telephone numbers and all physical, postal, email and Internet addresses, including all residences; (b) identify all business activities, including any business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest; and (c) describe in detail such Defendant's involvement in each such business, including title, role, responsibilities, participation, authority, control, and any ownership.

B. For 20 years after entry of this Order, each Defendant must submit a compliance notice, sworn under penalty of perjury, within 14 days of any change in the following:

1. Each Defendant must report any change in: (a) any designated point of contact; or (b) the structure of the Corporate Defendant or any entity that Defendant has any ownership interest in or controls directly or indirectly that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including: creation, merger, sale, or dissolution of the entity or any subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order.

2. Additionally, the Individual Defendant must report any change in: (a) name, including aliases or fictitious name, or residence address; or (b) title or role in any business activity, including any business for which such Defendant performs services whether as an employee or otherwise and any entity in which such Defendant has any ownership interest, and identify the name, physical address, and any Internet address of the business or entity.

C. Each Defendant must submit to the Commission notice of the filing of any

bankruptcy petition, insolvency proceeding, or similar proceeding by or against such Defendant within 14 days of its filing.

D. Any submission to the Commission required by this Order to be sworn under penalty of perjury must be true and accurate and comply with 28 U.S.C. § 1746, such as by concluding: “I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on: _____” and supplying the date, signatory’s full name, title (if applicable), and signature.

E. Unless otherwise directed by a Commission representative in writing, all submissions to the Commission pursuant to this Order must be emailed to DEbrief@ftc.gov or sent by overnight courier (not the U.S. Postal Service) to: Associate Director for Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20580. The subject line must begin: FTC v. COORGA Nutraceuticals Corp., et al., X150037.

X.

RECORDKEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants must create certain records for 20 years after entry of the Order, and retain each such record for 5 years. Specifically, Corporate Defendant and the Individual Defendant for any business that such Defendant, individually or collectively with Corporate Defendant, is a majority owner or controls directly or indirectly, must create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records showing the revenues from all products or services sold;
- B. Personnel records showing, for each person providing services, whether as an employee or otherwise, that person’s: name; addresses; telephone numbers; job title or position;

dates of service; and (if applicable) the reason for termination;

C. Records of all consumer complaints and refund requests, whether received directly or indirectly, such as through a third party, and any response;

D. All records necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including all submissions to the Commission; and

E. A copy of each unique advertisement or other marketing material.

XI.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring Defendants' compliance with this Order:

A. Within 14 days of receipt of a written request from a representative of the Commission, each Defendant must: submit additional compliance reports or other requested information, which must be sworn under penalty of perjury; appear for depositions; and produce documents for inspection and copying. The Commission is also authorized to obtain discovery, without further leave of court, using any of the procedures prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 29, 30 (including telephonic depositions), 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69.

B. For matters concerning this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Defendant. Defendants must permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employee or other person affiliated with any Defendant who has agreed to such an interview. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

C. The Commission may use all other lawful means, including posing, through its representatives as consumers, suppliers, or other individuals or entities, to Defendants or any individual or entity affiliated with Defendants, without the necessity of identification or prior

notice. Nothing in this Order limits the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.

D. Upon written request from a representative of the Commission, any consumer reporting agency must furnish consumer reports concerning Individual Defendant, pursuant to Section 604(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. §1681b(a)(1).

XII.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court retains jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

SO ORDERED this 12th day of Sept., 2016.



SCOTT W. SKAVDAHL
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE